

FINAL REPORT OF THE TASK FORCE ON RACE AND CULTURE

Presented to the City Council

By the Task Force Co-Chairs

Rosa Navejar

Lillie Biggins

Rabbi Andrew Bloom

Bob Ray Sanders

December 4, 2018



Today's Briefing

- Review **background** on appointment of task force
- Review highlights of May 1 **interim report**
- Present summary of **findings and recommendations**
- Discuss fiscal impact, municipal services, and **next steps**



June 27, 2017: City Council holds special called meeting

Announces intent to...

- Appoint a **Task Force on Race and Culture**,
- Appoint **four co-chairs**, and
- Appoint **other members** as selected by the co-chairs.



Rosa Navejar



Lillie Biggins



Rabbi Andrew Bloom



Bob Ray Sanders

Resolution No. 4817-08-2017
Appointing Task Force on Race and Culture
August 1, 2017

- Appointed **23 members**, including four co-chairs and 19 other members

- Assigned **three tasks**
 - **Community conversations** about race and culture
 - **Assessment of disparities** in provision of municipal services
 - **Leadership training**

- Task Force to be dissolved no later than **August 1, 2018**, one year after adoption of resolution

Task Force on Race and Culture

Four Co-Chairs

Lillie Biggins

Rabbi Andrew Bloom

Rosa Navejar

Bob Ray Sanders

18 Other Current Members

Charles Boswell

Walter Dansby

*Robert Fernandez**

Miriam Frias

Sara Gillaspie

Robert Goldberg

Yolanda Harper

Bishop Mark Kirkland

Nima Malek

*Rattana Mao**

Gilbert Marez

Arturo Martinez

Roxanne Martinez

Judy McDonald

*Terri Mossige**

Cory Session

Katie Sherrod

Ty Stimpson

Jennifer Trevino

Monica Vasquez

Rev. Tim Woody

** Resigned*

Mission: *To listen, learn, build, and bridge in order to create an inclusive Fort Worth for all residents.*

Vision: *Fort Worth will become a city that is inclusive, equitable, respectful, communal, and compassionate.*

Expanded Scope and Extended Deadline

Item	Original, 8/1/17	Revised, 5/1/18
Community conversations about race and culture	Some conversations among residents	Many , including conversations among City officials
Assessment of disparities	Some municipal services	Many quality-of-life issues as identified by residents
Leadership training	Some sessions	Many , including sessions for interested residents
Deadline	8/1/18	12/31/18

Leadership Training



- **City officials**
 - City Council, appointed officials, assistant city managers
 - Department heads
 - Assistant directors
- **Community leaders** selected by City Council and Task Force members
- **Interested residents**

Public Engagement

- **89 events**
 - Town hall meetings
 - Open house meetings
 - Community conversations
 - “Continuing the conversation” events
 - Leadership training for City officials
 - Leadership training for community leaders
 - Presentations to civic groups
- **2,113 participants**



Dates	Event Type	Host/Sponsor	Attendance
10/26/2017	Community Conversation	Arborlawn UMC, Harvest UMC, La Trinidad UMC	
11/2/2017	Community Conversation	Arborlawn UMC, Harvest UMC, La Trinidad UMC	
11/9/2017	Community Conversation	Arborlawn UMC, Harvest UMC, La Trinidad UMC	25
11/11/2017	Community Conversation	Black Contractors Assoc., Southeast Fort Worth Inc., Metropolitan Black COC	23
11/11/2017	Community Conversation	Catholic Charities, Tarrant NET/Read2Win	6
11/27/2017	Community Conversation	Episcopal Diocese of Fort Worth, Local Organizing Committee,Unity in the Community	
12/4/2017	Community Conversation	Episcopal Diocese of Fort Worth, Local Organizing Committee,Unity in the Community	
12/11/2017	Community Conversation	Episcopal Diocese of Fort Worth, Local Organizing Committee,Unity in the Community	39
11/18/2017	Community Conversation	Fort Worth Chamber, Hispanic Chamber of Commerce, Metropolitan Black Chamber of Commerce	20
11/2/2017	Community Conversation	Fort Worth League of Neighborhoods, NAACP, United Community Centers	
11/7/2017	Community Conversation	Fort Worth League of Neighborhoods, NAACP, United Community Centers	
11/9/2017	Community Conversation	Fort Worth League of Neighborhoods, NAACP, United Community Centers	38
10/23/2017	Community Conversation	Fort Worth Sister Cities, TCC	
10/30/2017	Community Conversation	Fort Worth Sister Cities, TCC	
11/6/2017	Community Conversation	Fort Worth Sister Cities, TCC	33
11/7/2017	Community Conversation	Hispanic Women's Network, Fort Worth Junior League, The Links, Women's Policy Forum	
11/14/2017	Community Conversation	Hispanic Women's Network, Fort Worth Junior League, The Links, Women's Policy Forum	
11/16/2017	Community Conversation	Hispanic Women's Network, Fort Worth Junior League, The Links, Women's Policy Forum	14
10/28/2017	Community Conversation	Multicultural Alliance	15
1/11/2018	Community Conversation	Race and Culture Task Force	
1/18/2018	Community Conversation	Race and Culture Task Force	
1/25/2018	Community Conversation	Race and Culture Task Force	13
11/6/2017	Community Conversation	Rotary Club of Fort Worth, TCU	
11/13/2017	Community Conversation	Rotary Club of Fort Worth, TCU	25

Dates	Event Type	Host/Sponsor	Attendance
11/4/2017	Community Conversation	United Community Centers, TWU (Group 1)	
11/4/2017	Community Conversation	United Community Centers, TWU (Group 3)	10
10/28/2017	Community Conversation	United Fort Worth, Downtown Fort Worth Inc.	
11/2/2017	Community Conversation	United Fort Worth, Downtown Fort Worth Inc.	26
11/4/2017	Community Conversation	Vision Fort Worth & Bridge Black Professionals	16
10/21/2017	Community Conversation	Trinity Habitat for Humanity	33
Total Number of Events: 30			Total Number Attended: 336
4/24/2018	Community Leadership Engagement	Race and Culture Task Force	5
4/28/2018	Community Leadership Engagement	Race and Culture Task Force	7
5/19/2018	Community Leadership Engagement	Race and Culture Task Force	45
5/29/2018	Community Leadership Engagement	Race and Culture Task Force	16
6/19/2018	Community Leadership Engagement	Race and Culture Task Force	57
6/29/2018	Community Leadership Engagement	Race and Culture Task Force	33
Total Number of Events: 6			Total Number Attended: 163
9/27/2018	Community Open House	Race and Culture Task Force	11
10/1/2018	Community Open House	Race and Culture Task Force	39
10/4/2018	Community Open House	Race and Culture Task Force	10
10/8/2018	Community Open House	Race and Culture Task Force	9
10/9/2018	Community Open House	Race and Culture Task Force	30
10/11/2018	Community Open House	Race and Culture Task Force	4
Total Number of Events: 6			Total Number Attended: 103
1/18/2018	Continuing The Conversation	Race and Culture Task Force	
1/25/2018	Continuing The Conversation	Race and Culture Task Force	
1/27/2018	Continuing The Conversation	Race and Culture Task Force	
1/27/2018	Continuing The Conversation	Race and Culture Task Force	

Dates	Event Type	Host/Sponsor	Attendance
1/29/2018	Continuing The Conversation	Race and Culture Task Force	
1/31/2018	Continuing The Conversation	Race and Culture Task Force	
2/1/2018	Continuing The Conversation	Race and Culture Task Force	
2/3/2018	Continuing The Conversation	Race and Culture Task Force	
2/3/2018	Continuing The Conversation	Race and Culture Task Force	
2/5/2018	Continuing The Conversation	Race and Culture Task Force	
2/8/2018	Continuing The Conversation	Race and Culture Task Force	
2/10/2018	Continuing The Conversation	Race and Culture Task Force	
2/10/2018	Continuing The Conversation	Race and Culture Task Force	
2/17/2018	Continuing The Conversation	Race and Culture Task Force	290
Total Number of Events: 14			Total Number Attended: 290
4/24/2018	Continuing The Conversation - Early Childhood Matters	Race and Culture Task Force	16
4/25/2018	Continuing The Conversation - Early Childhood Matters	Race and Culture Task Force	14
5/15/2018	Continuing The Conversation - Early Childhood Matters	Race and Culture Task Force	19
Total Number of Events: 3			Total Number Attended: 49
3/28/2018	Continuing The Conversation - Parent Liaison Groups	Race and Culture Task Force	22
3/29/2018	Continuing The Conversation - Parent Liaison Groups	Race and Culture Task Force	1
4/5/2018	Continuing The Conversation - Parent Liaison Groups	Race and Culture Task Force	10
4/6/2018	Continuing The Conversation - Parent Liaison Groups	Race and Culture Task Force	9
4/17/2018	Continuing The Conversation - Parent Liaison Groups	Race and Culture Task Force	6
4/17/2018	Continuing The Conversation - Parent Liaison Groups	Race and Culture Task Force	6
4/19/2018	Continuing The Conversation - Parent Liaison Groups	Race and Culture Task Force	9
4/27/2018	Continuing The Conversation - Parent Liaison Groups	Race and Culture Task Force	3
5/5/2018	Continuing The Conversation - Parent Liaison Groups	Race and Culture Task Force	6
Total Number of Events: 9			Total Number Attended: 72

Dates	Event Type	Host/Sponsor	Attendance
10/9/2017	Conversations with Assistant Directors	National League of Cities	42
10/25/2017	Conversations with Assistant Directors	National League of Cities	42
11/6/2017	Conversations with Assistant Directors	National League of Cities	42
Total Number of Events: 3			Total Number Attended: 126
10/9/2017	Conversations with Department Heads	National League of Cities	22
10/25/2017	Conversations with Department Heads	National League of Cities	22
11/6/2017	Conversations with Department Heads	National League of Cities	22
Total Number of Events: 3			Total Number Attended: 66
10/10/2017	Conversations with elected and appointed City officials	National League of Cities	16
10/24/2017	Conversations with elected and appointed City officials	National League of Cities	16
11/7/2017	Conversations with elected and appointed City officials	National League of Cities	16
Total Number of Events: 3			Total Number Attended: 48
	Presentations to civic groups	Race and Culture Task Force	300
Total Number of Events: 1			Total Number Attended: 300
10/2/2017	Town Hall	Race and Culture Task Force	180
3/8/2018	Town Hall	Race and Culture Task Force	140
Total Number of Events: 2			Total Number Attended: 320
4/23/2018	Training with Assistant Directors	National League of Cities	42
5/30/2018	Training with Assistant Directors	National League of Cities	42
6/13/2018	Training with Assistant Directors	National League of Cities	42
Total Number of Events: 3			Total Number Attended: 126
4/25/2018	Training with Department Heads	National League of Cities	22
5/31/2018	Training with Department Heads	National League of Cities	22
6/15/2018	Training with Department Heads	National League of Cities	22
Total Number of Events: 3			Total Number Attended: 66

Dates	Event Type	Host/Sponsor	Attendance
4/24/2018	Training with elected and appointed City Officials	National League of Cities	16
5/29/2018	Training with elected and appointed City Officials	National League of Cities	16
6/14/2018	Training with elected and appointed City Officials	National League of Cities	16
Total Number of Events: 3			Total Number Attended: 48
Grand Total Number of Events: 89			Grand Total Number Attended: 2113

Top Ten Issues

Discussed in Community Conversations

Rank	Issue	Number of Comments
1	Discrimination in education	70
2	Failure to acknowledge the pervasiveness of racism	64
3	Discrimination in economic development	63
4	Discrimination in criminal justice	62
5	Racial segregation in the community	52
6	Racial prejudice	45
7	Lack of political representation for minorities	40
8	Discrimination in public accommodations	34
9	Discrimination in employment	33
10	Discrimination in housing	26

Frequently Expressed Comments From Community Conversations

- Perception that **City is doing little or nothing** to improve race relations, racial equity, and cultural awareness.
- Problem is **systemic, structural, and institutional racism**, not simply personal or individual behavior.
- City leaders have **failed to acknowledge this problem**, causing victims of racism to feel unheard and causing perpetrators of racism to feel empowered.
- Need to **continue, expand, and deepen** community conversations about race and culture, and to clarify their measurable outcomes.



Task Force on Race and Culture
Public Meetings on Draft Recommendations

Thursday, September 27

Police Sixth Patrol Division Headquarters
8755 N. Riverside Drive

Monday, October 1

Hazel Harvey Peace Center for Neighborhoods
818 Missouri Avenue

Thursday, October 4

Southwest Regional Library
4001 Library Lane

Monday, October 8

Diamond Hill Community Center
1701 NE 36th Street

Tuesday, October 9

University Christian Church
2720 S. University Drive

Thursday, October 11

University of Texas at Arlington Research Institute
7300 Jack Newell Boulevard S.

Findings and Recommendations



Criminal justice



Economic development



Education



Governance



Health



Housing



Transportation

Analysis of Disparities

Attributable to Race and Culture

- **Extent** of disparities
- **Causes** of disparities
- **Recommendations**
- **Success measures**



Criminal Justice and Economic Development

Lillie Biggins



Extent of Criminal Justice Disparities



Indicator	Extent of Disparity	Data Sources
Arrests	Despite constituting 19% of Fort Worth’s population, African-Americans accounted for 41% of all arrests in 2016 and 41% again in 2017. Corresponding figures were 31% and 30% for Whites, and 27% and 28% for Hispanics.	FWPD Arrest Reports
Recruitment of minorities and females for training academy	Based upon averages for the past six recruit classes, <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 13% of recruits are African-American (versus 19% of population), • 26% of recruits are Hispanic (versus 34% of population), • 3% of recruits identify as Other (versus 6% of population), and • 16% of recruits are female (versus 51% of population). 	FWPD personnel reports; U.S. Census Bureau, 2012-2016 American Community Survey
Diversity of officers in certain specialized units	No African-American officers serve in any of the following units: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SWAT (26 total officers), • K-9 (11), • Criminal Intelligence (11), • Homicide (11), • Major Case (11), and • Robbery (16). Only one African-American officer serves on the Special Response Team (44 total officers).	FWPD personnel reports
Diversity of officers at first promotional rank: corporal/detective	Of 241 total officers at this rank, <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 16 (7%) are African-American, • 41 (17%) are Hispanic, and • 10 (4%) are Other. 	FWPD personnel records

Causes of Criminal Justice Disparities



- Many residents believe that law enforcement unfairly **targets African-Americans**.
- **Targeted recruiting efforts** have failed to generate much interest among minorities.
- **No cadet programs** are offered in Fort Worth ISD high schools to students who may be interested in law enforcement.
- Senior officers provide minorities with **little or no encouragement** to take promotional tests or to apply for positions in specialized units.
- Minority officers may not wish to be the **only minority officer** in a specialized unit.

Criminal Justice Recommendations

- **Civilian oversight** of Police Department
- Police **cadet program**
- **Diversity** within Police Department



Criminal Justice Success Measures



Racial and Cultural Disparities to be Addressed	Estimated Extent of Disparity, 2018 or Earlier Year	Projected Extent of Disparity, 2023
Resident perceptions of safety in their neighborhoods at night	Whites 64% Hispanics 48% African-Americans 57%	Whites 64%+ Hispanics 53% African-Americans 62%
Resident satisfaction with overall quality of local police protection	Whites 75% Hispanics 64% African-Americans 59%	Whites 75%+ Hispanics 69% African-Americans 64%
Arrests by incident	38.4% African-Americans 26.6% Hispanics 2.0% Other 33.0% Whites	37.0% African-Americans 26.0% Hispanics 2.0% Other 35.0% Whites
Composition of recruit classes	13% African-Americans 26% Hispanics 3% Other 58% Whites 16% Female (six most recent classes)	19% African-Americans 34% Hispanics 6% Other 41% Whites 20% Female
Composition of police force as a whole	10.6% African-Americans 19.9% Hispanics 3.6% Other 65.9% Whites 12.8% Female	12.0% African-Americans 21.0% Hispanics 3.8% Other 63.2% Whites 14.0% Female
Diversity of corporals and detectives	5.0% African-Americans 16.3% Hispanics 4.6% Other 74.1% Whites	6.5% African-Americans 18.0% Hispanics 5.0% Other 70.5% Whites

Extent of Economic Disparities



Indicator	Extent of Disparity	Data Sources
Unemployment rate	In Fort Worth, the 2016 unemployment rate for Whites was 4.2 percent, while African-American and Hispanic rates of unemployment stood at 6.1 percent and 5.7 percent , respectively. These disparities are generally consistent with national trends.	U.S. Census Bureau, 2016 American Community Survey One-Year Estimates
Median income	The median household income for Fort Worth in 2016, in inflation-adjusted dollars, was \$63,704 for Whites, but only \$41,317 for African-Americans and \$44,748 for Hispanics. These disparities are generally consistent with national trends, although the earnings of minority households are higher in Fort Worth than in the nation as a whole.	U.S. Census Bureau, 2016 American Community Survey One-Year Estimates
Minority-owned businesses	Of the top 100 privately-owned firms in Tarrant County, fourteen are owned by minorities and ten of those firms are located in Fort Worth. Six of the ten Fort Worth firms are owned by Hispanics.	2016 data from Fort Worth <i>Business Press</i>

Causes of Economic Disparities



- Unemployment rate is negatively correlated with **educational attainment**: The more educated the workforce, the lower the unemployment rate.
- While the rates of college graduation have increased significantly for all major racial and ethnic groups, **Whites are more likely to hold a bachelor's degree** than are members of other racial groups.
- Minorities are more likely than Whites to live in **economically depressed areas**, which tends to drive up their unemployment rate compared to Whites.
- Many employers continue practices that, while not explicitly discriminatory, tend to disadvantage minority job-seekers. When **executives hire solely or primarily through their own networks**, rather than interviewing several applicants for each position, this practice often shuts out people of color.
- **Access to capital** tends to be a significant issue for minorities seeking to start and grow their own businesses.

Economic Development Recommendations

- **Job training**, transportation to jobs, background issues, and hiring process
- Education and incentives to achieve **wage parity**
- **Capacity-building** for minority-owned businesses



Economic Development Success Measures



Racial and Cultural Disparities to be Addressed	Estimated Extent of Disparity, 2018 or Earlier Year	Projected Extent of Disparity, 2023
Unemployment rate	Whites 4.2% Hispanics 5.7% African-Americans 6.1%	Minority unemployment < 1 percentage point above White unemployment
Median household income	Whites \$63,704 Hispanics \$44,748 African-Americans \$41,317	Minority household incomes > 75% of White household incomes
Number of City procurement categories without any qualified minority firms	Nine of 203	None
Percentage of small firms receiving loans	17% of minority firms 23% of White-owned firms	Minority approval rate < 3 percentage points below White approval rate

Education and Governance

Rabbi Andrew Bloom



Extent of Education Disparities



Indicator	Extent of Disparity	Data Sources
Third-grade students reading at grade level	In the Fort Worth ISD, only 33% of all third-grade students were reading at grade level in 2016-17, compared to the statewide average of 44%. The percentage of third-grade students reading at grade level is 62% for Whites, but only 32% for Hispanics and 20% for African-Americans.	Read Fort Worth Data Dashboard
High school graduation rate	The graduation rate in 2016 was 88% for Whites, 85% for Hispanics, and 84% for African-Americans.	Texas Education Agency, 2016-17 Texas Academic Performance Report
College and career readiness	The percentage of graduates classified as college- and career-ready in 2016 was 84% for Whites, 74% for Hispanics, and 67% for African-Americans.	Texas Education Agency, 2016-17 Texas Academic Performance Report
Student disciplinary suspensions	Of all students suspended for disciplinary reasons in 2016-17, 55% were African-American, 37% were Hispanic, and 5% were White. By comparison, total student enrollment is 23% African-American, 62% Hispanic, and 11% White.	Fort Worth ISD report, 1/23/18
Location of underperforming schools	The Fort Worth ISD has 14 schools classified as “Improvement Required” and all are located in minority neighborhoods .	Texas Education Agency ratings

Causes of Education Disparities



- **Community engagement**, education, and awareness
- **Readiness** for kindergarten
- Access to **culturally relevant materials**
- **Quality curriculum**, instructors, and instruction
- Equitable distribution of **education resources**
- Exposure to **learning environments** and possible career paths

Education Recommendations

- Early childhood intervention via quality **childcare**
- **Service learning** and civic engagement
- **College and career centers**



Education Success Measures



Racial and Cultural Disparities to be Addressed	Estimated Extent of Disparity, 2018 or Earlier Year	Projected Extent of Disparity, 2023
Blending sounds	Whites 73% Hispanics 58% African-Americans 46%	Hispanics 68% African-Americans 56%
Listening comprehension	Whites 86% Hispanics 83% African-Americans 79%	Hispanics 93% African-Americans 89%
Letter sounds	Whites 76% Hispanics 68% African-Americans 68%	Hispanics 78% African-Americans 78%
Vocabulary	Whites 87% Hispanics 70% African-Americans 72%	Hispanics 80% African-Americans 82%
High school graduation rates	Whites 97% Hispanics 91% African-Americans 92% in 2016	97% for Hispanics and African-Americans
College and career readiness	Whites 84% Hispanics 74% African-Americans 67%	Hispanics 84% African-Americans 77%

Extent of Governance Disparities



Indicator	Extent of Disparity	Data Sources
Minority representation on City Council (district representatives)	Only one of eight district representatives on the City Council is Hispanic, whereas two are African-American and five are White. Hispanics have historically been under-represented on the City Council.	City Secretary's Office
Minority representation on City boards and commissions	Minorities represent only 30 percent of the City's board and commission members. Hispanics represent only 11 percent.	City Secretary's Office
Diversity of City executives and managers	Minorities represent only 29 percent of the City's executives and managers. Hispanics represent only 9 percent.	Human Resources Department
Diversity of firefighters	Minorities represent only 21 percent of the City's firefighters. African-Americans and Hispanics account for 8 percent and 11 percent, respectively. Only one percent of the City's firefighters are women.	Human Resources Department

Causes of Governance Disparities



- Incumbent City Council members redraw **Council district boundaries** after each decennial census and, in doing so, tend to favor boundaries that support their own re-election.
- For a variety of reasons, Hispanics in Fort Worth have tended not to participate in **voting and other civic activities** as much as have Whites and African-Americans.
- **Targeted recruitment** programs have not yet succeeded in attracting minority executives, police officers, and firefighters to Fort Worth in proportion to local minority populations.

Governance Recommendations

- Independent citizen **redistricting commission**
- Mission of **Human Relations Unit**
- Diversity **training**



Governance Success Measures



Racial and Cultural Disparities to be Addressed	Estimated Extent of Disparity, 2018 or Earlier Year	Projected Extent of Disparity, 2023
Minority representation on City Council (district representatives)	25.0% African-Americans 12.5% Hispanics 62.5% Whites	20% African-Americans 40% Hispanics 40% Whites
Minority representation on City boards and commissions	15% African-Americans 11% Hispanics 4% Other 70% Whites 36% Female	16% African-Americans 14% Hispanics 5% Other 65% Whites 40% Female
Voter participation in mayoral election	7.1% Super-Majority Minority Areas (SMMAs) 8.1% citywide	9.0% SMMAs 9.0% citywide
Diversity of City executives and managers	18% African-Americans 9% Hispanics 2% Other 71% Whites 34% Female	19% African-Americans 11% Hispanics 3% Other 67% Whites 37% Female
Diversity of police officers	10% African-Americans 19% Hispanics 3% Other 68% Whites 14% Female	11% African-Americans 21% Hispanics 4% Other 64% Whites 16% Female
Diversity of firefighters	8% African-Americans 11% Hispanics 2% Other 79% Whites 1% Female	9% African-Americans 12% Hispanics 2% Other 77% Whites 2% Female
Diversity of general (non-civil service) City employees	22% African-Americans 28% Hispanics 5% Other 46% Whites 38% Female	22% African-Americans 30% Hispanics 5% Other 44% Whites 41% Female
Perception that City is dedicated to diversity and inclusion	85% of all City employees	95% African-Americans 95% Hispanics 95% Other 95% Whites 95% Female

Health, Housing, and Transportation

Bob Ray Sanders



Extent of Health Disparities



Indicator	Extent of Disparity	Data Sources
High Blood Pressure	40% of African-American adults in Tarrant County have been diagnosed with high blood pressure, versus 30% of all adults in the county. Corresponding figures are 25% for Hispanics and 31% for Whites.	Tarrant County Public Health: Division of Epidemiology and Health Information. (2015 Statistics)
Obesity	38% of African-American adults in Tarrant County have a body mass index (BMI) of 30 or more, versus 30% of all adults in the county. Corresponding figures are 30% for Hispanics and 28% for Whites.	Tarrant County Public Health: Division of Epidemiology and Health Information. (2015 Statistics)
Cognitive Decline	23% of African-American adults in Tarrant County are experiencing confusion or memory loss that is increasing in frequency or worsening, versus 12% of all adults in the county. Corresponding figures are 6% for Hispanics and 11% for Whites.	Tarrant County Public Health: Division of Epidemiology and Health Information. (2015 Statistics)
Diabetes	16% of African-American adults in Tarrant County have been diagnosed with diabetes, versus 11% of all adults in the county. Corresponding figures are 12% for Hispanics and 9% for Whites.	Tarrant County Public Health: Division of Epidemiology and Health Information. (2015 Statistics)
Infant Mortality	9.6 African-American infant deaths per 1,000 live births were recorded in Tarrant County during 2015, versus 6.2 infant deaths per 1,000 overall. Corresponding figures are 6.6 for Hispanics and 4.3 for Whites.	Texas Department of State Health Services (2015 Statistics)

Causes of Health Disparities



- Limited access to **healthy foods**, which may be due to geographic location in the city, cost factors, income levels, transportation issues or other factors
- Lack of **safe places** to perform physical activity, which may be due to lack of sidewalks, public improvements, fear of stray/roaming animals or other factors
- Inability to seek **medical care**, which may be due to lack of funds, co-pays, deductibles, and other factors
- **Low literacy and lack of knowledge** about health, finances, and health insurance
- High rates of smoking
- **Stress and lack of support**, which makes it difficult to address health problems
- **Behavioral issues**, which may include depression, mental health issues, or others

Health Recommendations

- Health **education and outreach**
- Active **lifestyles**
- Healthy **foods**
- **Access** to providers



Health Success Measures



Racial and Cultural Disparities to be Addressed	Estimated Extent of Disparity, 2018 or Earlier Year	Projected Extent of Disparity, 2023
High blood pressure	African-Americans adults 40% versus 30% overall	African-American rate 37.5% or less
Obesity	African-American adults 38% versus 30% overall	African-American rate 35.5% or less
Cognitive decline	African-American adults 23% versus 12% overall	African-American rate 20.5% or less
Diabetes	African-American adults 16% versus 11% overall	African-American rate 13.5% or less
Infant mortality	African-American infant deaths 9.6 per 1,000 live births versus 6.2 overall	African-American rate 8.0 or less

Extent of Housing Disparities



Indicator	Extent of Disparity	Data Sources
Residential segregation	The degree of residential segregation for all minority populations in Fort Worth, as measured by the federal dissimilarity index , decreased between 1990 and 2010, from 53 to 45, but has increased back to 49 since 2010 .	City of Fort Worth, draft Assessment of Fair Housing Report, 2018
Households paying > 30% of income for housing	While 33% of all Fort Worth households pay over 30% of their gross income for housing, 45% of African-American households pay over 30% of their gross income on housing.	U.S. Census Bureau, 2009-2013 American Community Survey
Households in substandard or overcrowded housing	An estimated 13,000 Fort Worth households live in overcrowded or substandard conditions, i.e. without a complete kitchen or plumbing in their dwelling unit. Of these households, 7,600 or 59% are Hispanic.	U.S. Census Bureau, 2009-2013 American Community Survey

Causes of Housing Disparities



- Lack of **affordable housing**
- Minority **household incomes** tend to be below the average household income in Fort Worth.
- Many persons of color live in neighborhoods where most **housing was built prior to 1960**. Older housing is more likely to be in substandard condition and to require repairs.

Housing Recommendations

- Affordable housing **incentives policy**
- **Homebuyer** assistance
- **Resident awareness** of housing resources



Housing Success Measures



Racial and Cultural Disparities to be Addressed	Estimated Extent of Disparity, 2018 or Earlier Year	Projected Extent of Disparity, 2023
Rent-burdened households	56% African-Americans 47% Hispanics 38% Whites	53% African-Americans 45% Hispanics
Homeownership rate	39.7% African-Americans 57.0% Hispanics 63.6% Whites	39.9% African-Americans
Households living in substandard or overcrowded housing	9.9% Hispanics 3.5% African-Americans 0.9% Whites	6.9% Hispanics

Extent of Transportation Disparities



Indicator	Extent of Disparity	Data Sources
Street conditions	Majority Minority Areas (MMAs) of Fort Worth have 58% of street lane miles, but 77% of poor-condition streets ; 50% of built sidewalks, but 81% of poor-condition sidewalks and 58% of network gaps ; and 53% of installed street lights, but 66% of poor-condition street lights .	TPW's Pavement Quality Index and Street Asset Mapping
Automobile ownership rate	MMAs of Fort Worth have 57% of all households, but 77% of zero-car households , a proxy for alternative-transportation dependence.	U.S. Census Bureau 2012-2016 American Community Survey
Transit ridership	Non-Anglo racial and ethnic groups comprise 58% of Fort Worth's population, but 71% of local transit ridership at the time of the most recent on-board transit survey.	2014 NCTCOG Transit On-Board Survey
Crash incidence	69% of all pedestrian crashes and 79% of fatal pedestrian crashes occurred in MMAs from 2013 to 2017. During the same period, MMAs had 60% of all bike crashes and 86% of fatal bike crashes .	TxDOT Crash Records Information System
Funding by transportation mode	Since 2007, Fort Worth has funded approximately 20% of the street construction and reconstruction need; only 10% of the estimated annual operating need for the transit system ; less than 10% of the sidewalk need; and roughly 1% of the bike infrastructure need. This imbalance tends to affect minorities disproportionately.	City Bond Programs and CO sales, Transportation Impact Fee expenditures, sales tax allocation to transit, 2010 Bike FW Plan, 2014 Walk FW Plan, 2015 Transit Master Plan

Causes of Transportation Disparities



- MMAs tend to be concentrated in older parts of Fort Worth, and therefore have **older infrastructure** that is more likely to be in deteriorated condition. Additionally, prior **construction standards** allowed for the omission of sidewalks and for the use of asphalt pavement for streets, which has a higher maintenance need than concrete. As annual **maintenance budgets** fall short of the total need, MMAs may be disproportionately affected.
- MMAs are disproportionately affected by economic instability, have a higher incidence of disability, and have higher proportions of their population that are **younger than 18 or older than 64**. Furthermore, according to the federal government's low-cost transportation index, the **cost of transportation** tends to be higher in MMAs than in Fort Worth generally. All of these factors combine to explain higher rates of households **without automobiles** and greater dependence upon alternative transportation modes.

Transportation Recommendations

- Transportation **equity policy** and five-year action plan
- Transportation **funding criteria**
- **After-action reviews** of pedestrian and bicycle crashes



Transportation Success Measures



Racial and Cultural Disparities to be Addressed	Estimated Extent of Disparity, 2018 or Earlier Year	Projected Extent of Disparity, 2023
Street conditions	Super Majority-Minority Areas of Fort Worth have 35% of street lane-miles, but 50% of poor-condition streets	40% of poor-condition streets
Sidewalk conditions	Super Majority-Minority Areas of Fort Worth have 30% of built sidewalks, but 67% of poor-condition sidewalks	47% of poor-condition sidewalks
Street light conditions	Super Majority-Minority Areas of Fort Worth have 32% of installed street lights, but 43% of poor-condition street lights	33% of poor-condition streetlights
Crash incidence	Super-Majority Minority Areas comprise 25% of the city's land area, but had 49% of total bike and pedestrian crashes and 51% of fatal bike and pedestrian crashes from 2013 to 2017	39% of total bike and pedestrian crashes, and 41% of fatal bike and pedestrian crashes

Fiscal Impact, Municipal Services, and Next Steps

Rosa Navejar



Potential Impact of All Recommendations on FY2020 Budget

Committee	Amount by Funding Source			New Authorized Positions	
	City of Fort Worth	Other Entities	Total	Full-Time	Part-Time
Criminal Justice	\$373,584	--	\$373,584	1	20
Economic Development	385,000	\$ 25,000	410,000	3	--
Education	--	283,000	283,000	--	--
Governance	237,655	--	237,655	1	--
Health	604,000	--	604,000	--	--
Housing	624,900	--	624,900	1	--
Transportation	739,500	--	739,500	1	--
Total	\$2,964,639	\$308,000	\$3,272,639	7	20

Dashboard for Tracking Progress



Recommended Strategy	Actions Completed	Racial and Cultural Disparities to be Addressed	Estimated Extent of Disparity, 2018 or Earlier Year	Projected Extent of Disparity, 2023	Current Extent of Disparity
Civilian oversight of Police Department		Resident perceptions of safety in their neighborhoods at night	Whites 64% Hispanics 48% African-Americans 57%	Whites 64%+ Hispanics 53% African-Americans 62%	
		Resident satisfaction with overall quality of local police protection	Whites 75% Hispanics 64% African-Americans 59%	Whites 75%+ Hispanics 69% African-Americans 64%	
		Arrests by incident	38.4% African-Americans 26.6% Hispanics 2.0% Other 33.0% Whites	37.0% African-Americans 26.0% Hispanics 2.0% Other 35.0% Whites	
Police cadet program		Composition of recruit classes	13% African-Americans 26% Hispanics 3% Other 58% Whites 16% Female (six most recent classes)	19% African-Americans 34% Hispanics 6% Other 41% Whites 20% Female	
Diversity within Police Department		Composition of police force as a whole	10.6% African-Americans 19.9% Hispanics 3.6% Other 65.9% Whites 12.8% Female	12.0% African-Americans 21.0% Hispanics 3.8% Other 63.2% Whites 14.0% Female	
		Diversity of corporals and detectives	5.0% African-Americans 16.3% Hispanics 4.6% Other 74.1% Whites	6.5% African-Americans 18.0% Hispanics 5.0% Other 70.5% Whites	

Disparities in Municipal Services



Police



Municipal Court



Neighborhood
Services



Minority
Contracting

Next Steps

- December 11: **Adopt resolution** accepting task force findings and recommendations, and authorizing City Manager to proceed in implementing recommended strategies and actions.
- March 2019: **Receive report from City Manager** on status of implementation, including provisions for:
 - **Civilian oversight** of Police Department,
 - Appointment of **Charter Review Task Force** to study feasibility and desirability of independent redistricting commission,
 - Reorganization of **Human Relations Unit**,
 - Assessment of disparities in **municipal services**; and
 - Potential impact of all recommendations on **FY2020 budget**.
- December 2019: Publish first annual **progress report**.

**Questions?
Comments?**

